



City of Carmel

CARMEL PLAN COMMISSION SPECIAL STUDIES COMMITTEE JUNE 7, 2005

Minutes

The regularly scheduled meeting of the Special Studies Committee met at 6:00 PM on Tuesday, June 7, 2005 in the Caucus Rooms of City Hall, Carmel, Indiana.

Members in attendance: Jerry Chomanczuk; Wayne Haney; Steve Stromquist; Madeleine Torres.

The Department of Community Services was represented by Matt Griffin, City Planner, and Nathan Anderson, summer intern. Also in attendance: Mike Hollibaugh, Director, and John Molitor, legal counsel.

Matt Griffin announced that item 1., O'Malia Fireplace has been Tabled to the July meeting, and there are two Add-On Items. (Marriott Courtyard Signage and Raphael's Joy Signage)

The Special Studies Committee considered the following items:

1. Docket No. 04090045 ADLS: O'Malia Fireplace

The applicant seeks approval of a building and parking lot expansion. The site is located at 220 South Range Line Road. The site is zoned B-1/Business.

Filed by Paul Reis of Drewry Simmons Vornehm, LLP for Helen J. O'Malia Trust.

TABLED to July

2. Docket No. 05040003 DP/ADLS: Fidelity on Meridian

The applicant seeks approval to construct a 2 story, multi-tenant office/retail building on 2.36 acres with the following Zoning Waivers:

Docket No. 05040004 ZW: 23 B.08.03 A (1): Minimum Building Height

Docket No. 05040005 ZW: 23 B.08.01 C: Build-to Lines

The site is located at 11450 N. Meridian Street and is zoned B6/Business and is within the US 31 Corridor.

Filed by John Robinson for JRR Meridian, LLC.

Charlie Frankenberger, 5212 Carrington Circle, Carmel, attorney with Nelson & Frankenberger appeared before the Committee representing the applicant. Chris McComas and John Robinson were also in attendance.

The petitioner appeared before the May 17th meeting of the Plan Commission for public hearing. The petitioner is requesting Development Plan/ADLS Amend and certain Zoning Waivers in order to permit the replacement of the existing building with an up-scale, multi-tenant office/retail building. The subject site consists of 2.36 acres and is within the Fidelity Plaza located west of US 31 and south of 116th Street. The site is presently occupied by the existing Sunrise Café building.

A rendering was shown of the proposed building—detailed in the information packets. To the extent that there are some trees required but not shown on the landscape plan, the petitioner has agreed with the Urban Forester to make a contribution (\$300 or \$400 per tree) totaling close to \$6,000.

Certain zoning waiver are requested in order to achieve the redevelopment, including ADLS Amend and zoning waivers for Minimum Building Height and Build-to Lines. There are additional developmental standard variances being requested from the Board of Zoning Appeals, and the petitioner will be appearing before the BZA at a later date.

The building height requirement is 38 feet, three floors; the proposed building is 33'4" and two floors. The existing building is shorter than that and is one floor with a pitched roof. The other waiver is for the building setback line to extend it from nine feet to 101 feet.

All of the signage will be individually mounted and internally illuminated letters, off-white and consistent with the Fidelity Plaza.

Department Comments, Matt Griffin reported that this item was referred to Committee from the May 17th Plan Commission meeting. The petitioner has addressed the landscaping with Scott Brewer. Additional detail on building signage was also to be shown. These two items have been covered, and the Department recommends sending this back to the full Commission with a positive recommendation.

Madeleine Torres was complimentary of the design and thought the building was very tastefully done.

Jerry Chomanczuk commented that the first floor is 30% retail. Chris McComas responded that the percentage is actually less than 30%. The bank is not considered part of the retail.

Charlie Frankenberger reported that the Overlay permits up to 30% retail in any particular building if the overall retail for the entire area is less than or equal to 15%. The entire area for this project is the Fidelity Plaza and the petitioner is within the letter.

The petitioner agreed to do away with two "Do Not Enter" signs on the east. One sign is needed at each opening of the drive through. At this time, the petitioner has no prospects for tenancy for

the building. The petitioner would like to maximize the signage available to them and have the retailers fit within those parameters.

The building materials include “Trespa,” a recycled plastic “Green” product!

Madeleine Torres made formal motion to return **Docket No. 05040003 DP/ADLS, Docket No. 05040004 ZW and Docket No. 05040005 ZW, Fidelity on Meridian** to the full Commission with a favorable recommendation, seconded by Wayne Haney, Approved 4-0.

Docket No. 05050012 ADLS Amend: Tom Wood Subaru

The applicant seeks building alterations including the addition of stone columns, screening of HVAC, and additional lighting. The site is located at 3230 E. 96th Street and is zoned B3/Business.

Filed by Larry Lawhead.

Tom Engle, attorney with Barnes & Thornburg, 11 South Meridian Street, Indianapolis, appeared before the Committee representing the petitioner.

The Tom Wood Subaru dealership on 96th Street, east of Penske Chevrolet on the north side of the street was approved in early 2004. The project has since been constructed and there are three issues that have come up either during or after construction that are being brought before the Committee this evening.

Stone has been added to the south elevation of the building on either side of the stone element in the center of the building; this was done for balance and aesthetics.

The second request is the screening of rooftop HVAC. The screening panels were not shown in the original drawings—at that time, the panels had not been sized and the size of the HVAC was not known, even the exact location was not known. The panels have now been installed; they are a textured finish that matches the stucco on the walls.

The third issue is the site lighting. As installed, the site lighting does comply with the Ordinance and cuts off at point one foot candles at the property line around the perimeter of the facility. The petitioner is proposing to modify the lighting. Currently, there are two poles in the back and one in the front. The pole in the front has only one lamp on it. One pole in the back has a single lamp, and one has two lamps. The lighting indicates that to the west side, there are five foot candles existing along that side. There is a 5 or 6 foot tall masonry wall and most of the lighting is cut off and does not spill over onto the Subaru property. There is already a lot of excess light from the adjacent property. The petitioner proposes to add another lamp on the pole in the front, raise the pole to 24 feet, and add a second lamp. The petitioner would like to add a second lamp to the pole in the back that only has one lamp. The maximum foot candle level in the back is only 8.8, plus there is a wall around both sides that cuts off light from the adjacent property.

Tom Engle reported that the petitioner would need a variance from the Carmel BZA to increase the level of lighting, but also needs approval from the Committee under ADLS to modify the level of lighting.

Department Comments, Matt Griffin reported that the Department supports all three items and recommends approval after all concerns have been addressed.

Madeleine Torres asked if the HVAC was overlooked on the previous submission. Tom Engle responded that it was never brought up and it was not on the drawings, neither was the original unit. Madeleine said she did not have a problem with the unit itself but did have a problem with the process that Tom Wood has taken. The Committee has seen this project several times and it is usually for something that has already been done and permission is being requested after the fact.

Tom Engle said the petitioner did follow the process but for some reason, the HVAC screening was overlooked by everyone on this project. Tom Engel said he, too, was surprised when he saw the stone columns. The footprint of the building has not changed.

Jerry Chomanczuk was not thrilled with the “big box” look of the HVAC screening—it just looks like a big box and not really a screen.

Tom Engle said the screening was consistent with what they have done on other buildings.

Steve Stromquist made formal motion for approval of **Docket No. 05050012 ADLS Amend, Tom Wood Subaru** stone columns as presented, **and** conditioned upon lighting as proposed at 24 feet in height as long as it is no taller than the lighting standards on either of the two adjacent properties; screening is to remain as is, seconded by Wayne Haney, Approved 3 in favor, one opposed (Torres).

4. Docket No. 05050053 ADLS Amend: Opus Landmark at Meridian

The applicant seeks to make slight modifications to the original approval. The site is located at the 13000 Block of N Pennsylvania St. It is zoned B-2/Business and is in the US 31 Overlay.

Filed by Paul Reis of Drewry Simmons & Vornehm for Opus

Paul Reis, attorney, 8888 Keystone Crossing, appeared before the Committee representing the applicant. John Cumming and Alicia Polenick of Opus North Corporation were also in attendance.

This site is directly south of the Hilton Garden Inn, north of 126th and Pennsylvania, basically across the street from Summer Trace and Meijer's.

In the year 2000, Opus North was approved for three office buildings, however, that project did not progress. Subsequently, Kite Development came in in 2004 and submitted a proposal for two medical office buildings. Tonight, Opus North is seeking approval to build two, high-profile

office buildings consistent with all of the development plans that have been filed. The basic change is that the footprint or size of the buildings is much larger.

The medical office buildings were approximately 96,000 rentable square feet. The two buildings proposed are 106,511 square feet. The real change accommodates the larger footprint, adjusts the landscaping to accommodate the new building, and changes the parking. The parking is within the zoning ordinance requirements. The sign package that was approved in 2000 and 2004 is the same.

Department Comments, Matt Griffin asked if there were exact changes to the elevation that could be pointed out. Paul Reis responded that the petitioner literally took the plans—same materials. There is no physical connection between the buildings—these are larger buildings. Essentially, the materials are the same, design is the same, it is just a bigger footprint.

Matt Griffin said the Department is recommending approval after all concerns have been addressed.

Jerry Chomanczuk commented that with the larger footprint, there is 10,000 square feet moving someplace.

Paul Reis responded that because of the possibility of improvement of US 31, rather than doing the 90-foot build-to line and allowing for this development, the petitioner obtained a waiver whereby the building was allowed to be moved farther to the west. The other difference is that a medical office building requires more parking; a straight office building does not require a higher number of spaces.

Plans for a third future building? The petitioner responded that at the south end, off Carmel Drive, there is a possibility of a four-story, 140,000 square foot building. The two buildings proposed are “spec” buildings. The sign package remains the same.

Steve Stromquist made formal motion to approve **Docket No. 05050053 ADLS Amend, Opus Landmark at Meridian**, seconded by Madeleine Torres, Approved 4-0

5. Docket No. 05050051 ADLS Amend, Parkwood Crossing Building 7 – CSO Signage

The applicant seeks to install new wall signage.

The site is located at 280 East 96th Street. It is zoned B-6 and is in the US 31 Overlay.

This item requires a variance to allow the proposed sign size. The variance request will be heard at the June 07, 2005 BZA meeting by the Hearing Officer.

Filed by Steve Granner.

Steve Granner, Land Use Consultant with Bose, McKinney & Evans appeared before the Committee representing the applicant. Also in attendance: Brent Davis, CSO Architects, now known as CSO-Schinkle-Shultz.

CSO Architectural firm has merged with the Indianapolis firm of Schinkle-Shultz and causes a name change in the signage. The existing CSO sign letters on the building are 24 inches tall—the new letters spell out “CSO-Schinkle-Shultz and are 14 inches high. The existing logo is 84 inches tall and the new logo is one-quarter of an inch over 45 inches tall—much smaller. The primary color on the signs on the buildings is black and this sign will be black. The existing sign, both the logo and the CSO, is illuminated—on the new sign, only the logo will be illuminated and will be the “halo” effect. The individual letters, because of the font style, are too narrow and they will be pin-mounted.

At this time, the petitioner is requesting permission to replace the existing sign with the proposed sign, same color, the logo lighting is the same with the “halo” effect. The major difference is that the actual letters will not be illuminated in the new sign.

Department Comments, Matt Griffin reported that earlier this evening, the petitioner received approval from the BZA hearing officer for size. The sign is before the Committee for approval of the design of the sign. The Department is in support of this petition and recommends approval after Committee concerns have been addressed.

Madeleine Torres made formal motion to approve **Docket No. 05050051 ADLS Amend, Parkwood Crossing Building 7, CSO Signage**, seconded by Wayne Haney, APPROVED 4-0.

- 6. Docket No. 05050033 ADLS Amend. St. Vincent Hospital: Bariatric Center Sign**
The applicant seeks approval for a wall sign facing US 31. The site is located at 13500 N Meridian and is zoned B6/Business within the US 31 Overlay.
Filed by Tom Ely Jr. of The Sign Group Inc.

Tom Ely with The Sign Group, Inc. appeared before the Committee representing the petitioner. Gary Everling, St. Vincent Carmel Hospital was also in attendance.

Approval is requested to install a sign facing US 31 that would read “St. Vincent Bariatric Center of Excellence, per drawings submitted. The sign will be reverse-channel, halo illuminated letter, the same as all other signs on the St V campus on the walls. The proposed sign fits within the parameters allowed under the City Ordinance. The sign will be 25 inches tall and 40 feet, 9 inches wide, 84.76 total square feet. The copy will be painted white, the logo will be painted blue, and the entire display would be illuminated with white neon.

Department Comments, Matt Griffin reported that the Department is recommending approval after Committee comments and concerns have been addressed. The sign will also require BZA approval for the number of signs.

Gary Everling noted that the building they are putting the sign on is actually a separate building. There are three professional office buildings; there is no sign on this particular building, each of the buildings has a different address. The buildings are inner-connected on the interior.

Jerry Chomanczuk commented that this seems like one building, but with several “chapters” with separate entities, each one wanting his own signage. In this particular case, the tagline: “Center of Excellence” seems a little above and beyond—one would not expect anything less than excellent from St. Vincent. Would this encourage other medical facilities to have “more excellence?”

Gary Everling responded that to acquire the Center of Excellence name, there are a number of requirements that must be met. The patients are well-educated and aware of those requirements, more than any other patient, and they are on-line a lot. St. V feels it is a real competitive advantage to have the tagline on the sign. There is some meaning to “Of Excellence.” There is an American Society of Bariatrics, and this is a national designation.

Madeleine Torres asked if the doves would be blue or white; Gary Everling said they could go either way.

The signs on the buildings are reverse channel letters, constructed of aluminum, neon illuminated and shine from the back to create the halo outline of the letters.

Further Department Comments: Matt Griffin said there was some confusion as to the BZA approval and whether or not it is for the number of signs. At this time, it was determined to make any approval contingent on BZA approval if necessary.

Steve Stromquist made formal motion to approve **Docket No. 05050033 ADLS Amend, St. Vincent Hospital Bariatric Center Sign**, conditioned upon BZA approval IF NEEDED, seconded by Wayne Haney, **APPROVED** 4-0.

7. Docket No. 05050052 ADLS Amend, Family Christian Store

The applicant seeks to install new wall signage & awnings. The site is located at 715 East Carmel Drive. It is zoned B-8/Business and is in the US 431 Overlay.
Filed by Randy Whiteman of North American Signs.

Randy White, North American Signs appeared before the Committee representing the applicant. Barbara Eden of Carson Designs was also in attendance.

The applicant is proposing three sets of reverse channel letters with a purple background on the building located at 715 East Carmel Drive. There will be purple vinyl in use as well. The awnings will also be purple. The petitioner is requesting a standard, neon, “Open” sign in the window. A portion of the front entrance will be covered with the purple vinyl—the awning over the front entry.

Version #2 is preferred by the applicant--awnings over the brick. There are issues with the windows that need to be dealt with.

Barbara Eden, Carson Designs addressed the Committee. The problem with the building is that the triangle, jut-out windows are all aluminum storefront. There is no metal or brick structure to

mount awnings. If awnings were mounted, they would go right into the storefront frames. One of the problems with this building that is currently under repair is the leaks in the roof above the windows. The owners put in a lot of money in waterproofing and repairing the roof. Drilling holes for the awnings would intrude upon the structure and the integrity of the storefront.

Department Report, Matt Griffin commented that the way the awnings are addressed, especially on the “bump-outs” are not preferable and the Department would like to see the awnings as one continual awning rather than broken into several panels. The awnings don’t make sense just on the brick—the purpose of an awning is to keep sun from coming into the building. The proposal looks like a “tack-on” that serves no purpose.

Barbara Eden responded that the awnings create an aesthetic relief to the brick and hard aluminum. The awnings are also proposed for the two flat windows on the northwest corner of the building. All of the flat areas of the front façade are covered with awnings—the bump-outs are not covered.

Madeleine Torres commented that if the awnings cannot go over the windows, she would prefer none at all. Possibly, on the corner flat windows, awnings could be affixed and that would be great, but absolutely not in favor of awnings over a brick surface.

Jerry Chomanczuk asked how tied into to the colors the petitioner was—Randy Whiteman said the purple is their corporate identity, their branding.

Jerery Chomanczuk asked if there were other ways of breaking up the brick without putting awnings over the brick—perhaps plants, or climbing ivy, or design molding on the side of the building.

Barbara Eden said the awnings would be easy to change to the Merchants Square blue if the building changed tenants. Ms. Eden thought the proposal was a good compromise and does not “overdo it.”

Jerry Chomanczuk asked about the purple illumination. Randy Whiteman responded that the awnings are not illuminated. The petitioner has changed his mind. Signage: The channel letters are to be reverse channel, halo lit letters, illuminated with white LED lighting on the inside of the letters. The lighting will be white rather than purple.

Steve Stromquist asked about the location of the awnings. Ms. Eden said there will be no awnings over the windows facing Keystone Way. Steve Stromquist suggested one continuous awning over the windows.

Wayne Haney was not in favor of awnings over the brick and not in favor of the purple vinyl over the windows.

There was more discussion regarding covering the windows with purple vinyl to match the purple awnings, the placement of the proposed awnings, and the color purple. The Committee

recommended the petitioner return with revised drawings and a clear picture of the front entry for review by the full Commission.

The Committee Tabled Docket No. 05050052 ADLS Amend, Family Christian Store, to the full Plan Commission meeting on June 21, 2005.

8. Docket No. 05050055 ADLS Amend: Providence at Old Meridian Apartment

The applicant seeks to replace existing monument signage. The site is located at 300 Providence Boulevard and is zoned M3.

Filed by David Leazenby for Buckingham Arbors, LLC.

David Leazenby, Buckingham Companies appeared before the Committee representing the applicant. The petitioner is requesting a change-out of the existing sign at the Arbors, now Buckingham, on Providence Boulevard. The sign on Carmel Drive was not changed—it has a black inset, and the frame has a dated look. The goal is to make the signage similar to the entrance on Old Meridian Street. The sign in the information booklet is beside Meridian Music, and that same sign would be installed on either side of the entrance on Carmel Drive. The signs are six feet in height, 9.8 feet wide. Where the existing sign will be removed in the median, the petitioner will replace with plant materials and flowers to be commensurate with the Meridian Street entrance.

Wayne Haney commented that he liked the signage, thought it was appropriate and very well done. However, the wrought iron approach and the sign do not have the impact to the entrance to the development that the existing one has.

Department Report, Matt Griffin commented that the Department is recommending approval after all concerns have been addressed.

Madeleine said she did not have a problem with the wrought iron, but would rather see it in the middle with landscaping around it, maybe to hide the lighting. Madeleine thought she would be more in favor of leaving the sign where it is, and changing it to the wrought iron—the sign would be double-sided.

Steve Stromquist made formal motion for approval of Docket No. 05050055 ADLS Amend, Providence at Old Meridian, seconded by Madeleine Torres, APPROVED 4-0.

9. Docket No. 05050054 ADLS Amend: Gradle Drive Warehouse Expansion

The applicant seeks to create a 12,600 sq. ft. warehouse expansion. The site is located at 479 Gradle Drive. It is zoned I1/Industrial.

Filed by Mark Monroe for BFI Properties, LL

Mark Monroe, 12329 Brookshire Parkway, Carmel, attorney with offices at One Indiana Square, Suite 1800, Indianapolis appeared before the Committee representing BFI properties in their ADLS Amendment petition.

The site is located at 479 Gradle Drive and is within the Gradle Industrial Park west of City Hall. Carmel Drive is to the south of the subject site. The site is adjacent to Kaufman Products to the south, Carmel Ice Skadium to the east, Real Mechanical to the north, and various and sundry offices across the street on Gradle.

The site currently contains three buildings: one building is existing office and warehouse to the front; 2 warehouse buildings are to the rear. A small building to the north will be demolished to accommodate the warehouse expansion. The warehouse expansion will not be in direct view of any passersby on Gradle Drive and is almost completely shielded by the existing building. The expansion has been designed to complement the existing building. The colors are basically beige and brown. The only additional lighting is for security purposes on the east and south sides of the building.

There is to be no additional signage or awnings. The site plan shows additional landscaping and the petitioner believes he has addressed the City Forester's concern by planting additional trees along Gradle Drive.

Department Comments, Matt Griffin commented that this proposal will also require a BZA variance to permit the reduction of the bufferyard plantings along the side and the rear yard.

Mark Monroe responded that he had met with the City Urban Forester. The existing building has landscaping to the front, and the sides. There is parking lot landscaping behind the building that will actually be replaced along Gradle Drive. Because the site has overhead electrical lines on the south property and very little ground to the north to plant trees, Scott thought our best efforts would be for the landscaping in front of the building and additional trees will be planted along Gradle Drive.

Mark said this petition actually provides for the addition of some parking spaces. Some stripped parking has been added behind the building and in front of the existing building. The existing uses are a printing company and a natural stone company. The warehouse expansion is primarily for the use of the stone company for their warehousing needs.

Steve Stromquist made formal motion to approve Docket No. 05050054 ADLS Amend, Gradle Drive Warehouse Expansion, seconded by Madeleine Torres, APPROVED 4-0.

ADD-ON ITEMS:

10. Docket No. 05040019 ADLS Amend, Mariott Courtyard

The applicant seeks to replace 2 signs (1 ground and 1 wall.) The site is located at 10290 N. Meridian Street. It is zoned B-6 and is in the US 31 Overlay.
Filed by Christian Golden of GSW Lighting, LLC

Tabled to July

11. Docket No. 05060008 ADLS Amend, Raphael's Joy Signage

S:\PlanCommission\Minutes\SpecialStudiesCommittee\pc-ss2005june07

10

Request for signage on Range Line Road in Old Town.
Filed by Carolyn Burgess

Carolyn Burgess appeared before the Committee representing the petitioner. Signage is being requested for Raphael's Joy on Range Line Road in Old Town, opening in September. Raphael's Joy is a holistic, anti-aging health spa.

The dimensions of the sign have been adjusted to fit in with the requirements of the Sign Ordinance; the sign is 4 feet wide by 3 feet tall.

Department Report, Matt Griffin commented said he had reviewed the sign and thought it would work out nicely.

Overall, the Committee was favorable in their comments on the proposed signage, except for the telephone number and the Committee suggested that the area code could be eliminated, the size of the phone number could be increased, and the hours could be enlarged. The committee suggested removing the hours and keeping the website for information.

Steve Stromquist made formal motion for approval of **Docket No. 05060008 ADLS Amend, Raphael's Joy Signage**, location/placement to be approved by the Department, seconded by Wayne Haney, **APPROVED**4-0.

There being no further business to come before the Committee, the meeting was adjourned at 8:30 PM.

Jerry Chomanczuk, Chairperson

Ramona Hancock, Secretary